



To: Dr. Mike Riggle
Board of Education

From: Dr. R.J. Gravel
Mr. Ryan Manly
Dr. Kimberly Ptak

Date: Monday, May 21, 2018

Re: Approval of Multifunction Printer Purchase

Recommendation

It is recommended that the Board of Education

1. Approve the purchase of 80 multifunction Canon walk-up printers for a total cost of \$381,280; and an annual service and supply agreement in the estimated amount of \$45,750.
2. Approve the purchase of 4 multifunction Canon printers for a total cost of \$42,384; and an annual service and supply agreement in the estimated amount of \$46,150.

Background

At the May 13, 2013 board meeting, the Board approved the purchase of 71 walk-up multifunction printers (MFPs), 4 High Speed Production devices and 92 network printers for classrooms and labs for a total cost of \$467,519. The purchase was financed through a 5 year, \$1 buy-out lease which ends June 30, 2018; at which time the District will own the devices.

Throughout the last 5 years, the overall annual print and copy volume, district-wide, has consistently measured around 20 million impressions (an impression can be a copy, print, scan or fax image). The central copy centers represent approximately 55% of the impression volume district-wide. Additionally, each department, depending on size, has one or two MFPs to support walk-up needs from staff and students, representing 45% of the impression volume. When impression volume is combined, approximately 99% of impressions are monochrome (use of only black toner), and only 1% color.

The current fleet of MFPs have performed well over the last five years, but have started to demonstrate significant deficiencies in their performance. Continuation with these machines through refurbishment would not be cost effective, given technological developments and overall design changes since we last purchased machines. It should also be noted that 5 years is an industry average for the lifespan of these types of machines. Recognizing these considerations, the District started the review process for new equipment in the Fall of 2017. The Request for Proposal is for 80 MFPs and 4 production devices. The 92 printers are being phased out and will not be replaced,

Request for Proposal Process

A Request for Proposal (RFP) process was conducted and RFPs were sent to 16 companies representing Canon, Xerox, Kyocera, Konica Minolta, Lexmark, Toshiba, Samsung, Ricoh and HP devices. The RFP was broken out into four packages, and bid specifications emphasized that multiple vendors could be awarded the contract should it be in the best interest of the district:

- Package 1: Multifunction Devices for Office and Department Areas
- Package 2: Multifunction Devices for Central Print Centers
- Package 3: Supply and Maintenance Contract for Package 1 and Package 2
- Package 4: Trade in Price for Existing Equipment Purchased in July 2013

On Wednesday, April 18, 2018, a pre-RFP meeting was held to give vendors the opportunity to review the specifications, view a map of current device locations and participate in a Q&A session. The specifications required the recommended device be compatible with the District's existing PaperCut print management technology. PaperCut provides staff the ability to submit print jobs to a global print queue, and securely retrieve their print job from any MFP in the district by logging into the device with a barcoded staff identification card. PaperCut also provides the ability to account for MFP usage by user, department, and school, to identify trends and addressing internal billing needs.

Proposals were due on Monday, May 7, 2018 and nine (9) were received. Proposals were grouped together by bid package, manufacturer, and the model of devices recommended. A total of six (6) equipment manufacturers were represented.

It should be noted that the RFP included a Package 4, allowing vendors to provide a trade-in value for the existing fleet of equipment. Most vendors did not provide a trade-in value while others requested time to further evaluate the fleet. The anticipated trade-in value is minimal and will be handled through the Board approved Disposal of Surplus Equipment policy. In an effort to manage costs, the RFP requested pricing for 60 monochrome devices and 20 monochrome devices with color capability. Some proposals offered extremely competitive pricing for its color device, allowing the District to standardize with one device as opposed to one color *and* one monochrome device. Although the devices will all have color capabilities, color will continue to be limited to only designated users, based on direction from the school leadership teams.

Multifunction Walk-up Printers

Equipment Manufacturer	Vendor Representative *	Package 1 Walk-Up MFP (80) **	Package 3 Annual Maintenance +	Total Cost for the First Year
Canon	Canon Direct	\$381,280	\$45,750	\$427,030
HP	Imagetec	\$361,359	\$43,975	\$405,334
Konica Minolta	Konica Minolta Direct	\$465,420	\$45,300	\$510,720
Sharp	Gordon Flesch	\$372,140	\$43,200	\$415,340
Toshiba	Proven IT	\$388,060	\$40,230	\$428,290
Xerox	Xerox Direct	\$433,460	\$59,750	\$493,210

* Lowest bid received for this equipment manufacturer

** For all manufacturers except Canon, there are 60 monochrome MFPs and 20 color MFPs; Canon includes 80 color MFPs

+ Based on 20,000,000 total impressions (55% performed in the printer center, 45% performed on the walk-up MFPs)

Production Devices

Equipment Manufacturer	Vendor Representative *	Package 2 Production Devices (4)	Package 3 Annual Maintenance +	Total Cost for the First Year
Canon	Canon Direct	\$42,384	\$46,150	\$88,534
Konica Minolta	Imagetec	\$54,666	\$41,775	\$96,441
Xerox	Xerox Direct	\$51,704	\$58,100	\$109,804

* Lowest bid received for this equipment manufacturer

+ Based on 20,000,000 total impressions (55% performed in the printer center, 45% performed on the walk-up MFPs)

Evaluation Process

Proposals were evaluated based on overall device performance, integration with the District's print management software, user interface, device footprint and price. Mr. Zia Ahmed and Mr. Ryan Manly, along with Dr. R.J. Gravel, reviewed and evaluated the devices at both vendor locations and on-site. After an extensive review of the solutions, Canon Direct's proposal and associated equipment proved the most suitable for Glenbrook's environment. The following is a brief summary of elements that resulted in the selection of the Canon solution:

- **Overall Solution Benefits**

- Ability to deploy color MFPs to all locations at a reduced device cost, while maintaining comprehensive budgetary control (through access restrictions to copying *and* printing functions)
- The Canon user interface for base functions is wholly customizable, clear, uncluttered, and intuitive
- MFPs automatically submit service calls to Canon for issues that are detected requiring support from a service technician
- Canon service technicians are rated on mean copies between failure, they are *not* rated on ticket resolution time
- Canon service technicians utilize an app that provides comprehensive service information, history, and life cycle of all parts for a given MFP
- MFPs check-in nightly for firmware updates and servicing
- Canon offers a customer portal providing departments tracking and shipping details for incoming supplies such as toner
- Quarterly reports and reviews provided by Canon to ensure that service expectations are met
- The job transaction is encrypted on the wire; print jobs are wiped from the internal hard drives after completion
- District staff have the ability to wipe MFPs on demand, up to DoD standards

- **Walk-Up Machine Benefits**

- Prompt wake time for users through incorporation of a motion sensor that detects a user approaching the MFP
- An internal finisher provides a small footprint while still providing stapling and hole punch options (this will allow us to explore creative placement of MFPs for easy access to students at all times of the day throughout the district)
- Large, interactive touch panel that incorporates digital soft keys (software configured system options) and physical hard keys such as a number pad and start/stop options
- Distinct LED indicators for errors for identifying issues (e.g. power, processing)

- **Copy Center Machine Benefits**

- Productivity tools for production planning: job scheduler for up to 8 hours of plan ahead production
- Remote Manager allows remote job submission, management and monitoring
- Advanced Job Management for workflow customization
- In-line finisher and booklet maker
- 105 ppm and 75 ppm machine capacity in each copy center

Payment Structure

Recognizing that there are several leases totaling \$525,788 which expire this year and will not be renewed, there is capacity within the 2018-19 fiscal year budget to pay for this purchase of \$423,664 in a single, lump sum payment. Purchasing this equipment in full will eliminate expenses associated with a multi-year lease, such as lease origination fees and interest costs.